

# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

PPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO	
09/986,515	11/09/2001	Richard W. Cruse	SIL-0007-3-DIV	5549	
43246 75	90 10/18/2005		EXAMINER		
GEAM - SILI	CONES - 60SI		EGWIM, KEL	ECHI CHIDI	
IP LEGAL ONE PLASTIC	S AVENUE		ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER	
PITTSFIELD,	MA 01201-3697	1713			

DATE MAILED: 10/18/2005

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

		Application	n No.	Applicant(s)				
Office Action Summary		09/986,51	5	CRUSE ET AL.				
		Examiner		Art Unit				
		1	i C. Egwim	1713				
The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address Period for Reply								
A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.  - Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.  - If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.  - If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.  - Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).  Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).								
Status			•					
1)🖂	Responsive to communication(s) filed on <u>05 May 2005</u> .							
2a) <u></u> ☐	This action is <b>FINAL</b> . 2b)⊠ Th	his action is n	on-final.					
3)□	Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under <i>Ex parte Quayle</i> , 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.							
Dispositi	on of Claims							
5)□ 6)⊠ 7)□	Claim(s) 1-13 and 33-40 is/are pending in the 4a) Of the above claim(s) 4,7-9,13 and 33-40 Claim(s) is/are allowed.  Claim(s) 1-3,5,6 and 10-12 is/are rejected.  Claim(s) is/are objected to.  Claim(s) are subject to restriction and	<u>0</u> is/are withdr	- •	n.				
Applicati	on Papers							
9)[	The specification is objected to by the Exami	iner.						
10) The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) accepted or b) objected to by the Examiner.								
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).								
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).  11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.								
Priority ι	ınder 35 U.S.C. § 119							
12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).  a) All b) Some * c) None of:  1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.  2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No  3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).  * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.								
Attachmen			_					
	e of References Cited (PTO-892) e of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)		4) Interview Summary ( Paper No(s)/Mail Da					
3) 🛛 Infor	nation Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/0 r No(s)/Mail Date <u>070705</u> .	08)		atent Application (PTC	)-152)			

Application/Control Number: 09/986,515

Art Unit: 1713

#### **DETAILED ACTION**

Page 2

#### Continued Examination Under 37 CFR 1.114

1. A request for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, including the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e), was filed in this application after final rejection. Since this application is eligible for continued examination under 37 CFR 1.114, and the fee set forth in 37 CFR 1.17(e) has been timely paid, the finality of the previous Office action has been withdrawn pursuant to 37 CFR 1.114. Applicant's submission filed on 05/05/2005 has been entered.

#### Election/Restrictions

2. This application still contains claims 4, 7-9, 13 and 33-40 drawn to nonelected inventions.

## Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112

- 3. The following is a quotation of the second paragraph of 35 U.S.C. 112:
  The specification shall conclude with one or more claims particularly pointing out and distinctly claiming the subject matter which the applicant regards as his invention.
- 4. Claims 1-3, 5, 6 and 10-12 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 112, second paragraph, as being indefinite for failing to particularly point out and distinctly claim the subject matter which applicant regards as the invention.

Art Unit: 1713

5. Two conflicting limitations together in the same claim is considered indefinite, since the resulting claim does not clearly set forth the metes and bounds of the patent protection desired. In the present instance, claim 1, from which the balance of the claims depend, recites "wherein i) for structures (1) and (2), Y is ...", but the claim also recites "ii) for structure (1), Y is ...", which is a divergent definition of Y in structure (1) in claims.

#### Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102/103

6. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless -

- (b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.
- 7. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:
  - (a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.
- 8. Claims 1-3, 5, 6 and 10-12 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as anticipated by or, in the alternative, 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Pletka et al., for the same reasons cited in the previous action.

Even if assuming that the prior art references do not meet the requirements of 35 U.S.C. 102, it would still have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art, at the time the invention was made, to arrive at the same inventive composition because the

Art Unit: 1713

disclosure of the inventive subject matter appears within the generic disclosure of the prior art. See MPEP § 2111 - § 2117.

### Response to Arguments

9. Applicant's arguments filed 04/14/2005 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

The arguments are centered on the new conflicting limitations that have been rejected under 112. While it is unclear what applicant is claiming, it still appears that if the claim are not anticipated by the reference, they would still have been obvious over Pletka et al.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Dr. Kelechi C. Egwim whose telephone number is (571) 272-1099. The examiner can normally be reached on M-T (7:30-6:00).

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, David Wu can be reached on (571) 272-1114. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Art Unit: 1713

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

KCE

KELECHIC. EGWIM PH.D. PRIMARY EXAMINER